

CHAPTER 5
THE INFLUENCE OF TAIGI LITERATURE DEBATES ON THE
FUTURE DEVELOPMENT OF TAIGI LITERATURE–
ESTABLISHING A MULTI-LANGUAGE AND MULTI-CULTURE
SOCIETY

Preface

The Taigi literature debates that pursued literary language status for Taigi broke the authority of the Mandarin-only policy and revitalized a multi-language and multi-cultural society in Taiwan. Discussion about the influence on the debates on the future development of Taigi literature is divided into three sections as follows.

The first section will examine the expansion of the living space of Taigi literature. Through the Taigi culture debates, more and more people became interested in creating works of Taigi literature. This made the creation of Taigi literature more abundant and diverse. Examination of the main thoughts of the Taigi literature society and the writers group, allowed us to realize that the Taigi literature camps pursued the status of literary language for Taigi in order to build up the subjectivity of Taiwan literature. Obviously, it has still been necessary to strive for high language and script status for the Taigi language.

The second section will describe the striving for high language by looking at the language and culture awakening movements and dilemmas for indigenous people and Hakka ethnic groups. These movements were influenced by the Taigi literature debates, and enhanced the chances for other mother languages to pursue cultural subjectivity. Hakka and indigenous languages also tried to be regarded as high

languages and scripts, but they encountered difficulties in the realm of literature. Actually, they had some achievements in this process of striving for high language and script status. For instance, they have specialized organizations within the government in charge of the issues related to Hakka ethnic groups and indigenous people. They were also able to have their voices heard in the public arena of electronic media such as radio and television.

The third section describes promoting equilibrium development between localization and globalization. Each ethnic group in Taiwan has returned to identification with their own native language and culture, but under the influence of globalization and the popularity of the English language, this local identification has been eroded. Thus deciding how to get a balance between localization and globalization became an extremely big issue. The logical stages of ‘mother language first, then common language, and foreign language last’ seemed to be one of the available ways to do this. Therefore enhancing the language level of the mother tongue and implementing vernacular education programs were the best way to solve this.

5.1 Expanding the living space of Taigi literature

Although the National Language Policy was still implemented in Taiwan and Taigi literature was still not achieved a breakthrough, more and more people were putting their effort into Taigi literature as a result of the Taigi literature debates. In addition to the participants in the debate, many more people subsequently joined it. Societies of Taigi literature were established in succession, and they published some publications. Consequently, a wider and more abundant diversity of works of Taigi literature were created with varied subjects and topics. As a result, the Taigi literature

movement's development kept on booming. Moreover, it continued to increase its energy. If the book Chen (1990b) written by Lin Zong-Yuan, Siangyang and some several poets, presented the early period of Taigi poem in 1980s, then the book Lin (1998) revealed the message that poetry creations by Taigi poets had expanded rapidly in the 1990s.

For the anthology of Lin (1998), Lin Yang-Min collected 51 poets and 92 pieces of Taigi poetry between 1931 and 1997 (a total of 66 years). Thirty-five of the poet were new recruits who joined after 1991, and their new creations increased the total by 63 pieces. The 92 poems were chosen from 312 pieces, which in turn had been selected from roughly 2000 poems. Thus the creations selected in the book were the finest representatives of Taigi poetry. As of 2002, because of the projects of Huang Jing-Lian, fourteen of these writers published their personal albums. These albums comprised the ever first volumes of the Taigi literature series, including Taigi poetry and Taigi literature anthologies. In the Taiwanese poetry anthology of Chen (2003), there were 11 poets writing 96 pieces of poem, eight of them were new poets. In the Taiwanese literature anthology of Chen & Shih (2006), included prose, novels, and poetry, there were 23 writers and seven of them were new writers. The achievements of Taigi works of literature, of course, were related to the many publications of the Taigi societies, thus I have picked some Taigi societies and the indexes of their publications as a point of departure for observing Taigi literature development.

In fact, the Taigi societies were established gradually after 1991, the year after the first phase of the Taigi literature debates was over. During the third phase of the Taigi literature debates within a five short years, more than ten societies or publications were established or published. Although most of them subsequently

stopped publishing, two continued to publish until recently, which deeply influenced the development of Taigi literature.¹ Among them, the Hanchi Poetry Society, the Overseas Taiwanese Writing Society in Los Angeles, U.S.A., and the Promotion Society of Taiwanese Literature were worth discussing regarding the development of Taigi literature as follows:

A. The Hanchi Poetry Society

The Hanchi Poetry Publication published by the Hanchi Poetry Society, was established in May 1991, with a total of seven issues, and it stopped publishing in June 1996. The Hanchi Poetry Society was historically the first Taigi poetry society, which made the *Hanchi Poetry Publication* the first Taigi literature publication.

At that time, the Taigi writers Lin Zong-Yuan, Huang Jing-Lian, Lin Yang-Min, Li Khin-hoan, Chen Ming-Ren, Huang Heng-Ciu, Jhou Hong-Ming, Jhan Jyun-Ping and Jhuang Buo-Lin, were sponsors of this society. The main purposes of this society are listed as follows:

1. This society claims to create legitimate Taiwan literature using native language.
2. This society encourages the creation of Taigi literature, Hakka literature and Taiwan aboriginal literature using the mother tongue.
3. This society expects that the Taigi literature can achieve the following purposes in the current phase:
 - 3.1 Creating the new Taiwan literature with the spirit and features of the Taiwan nation.
 - 3.2 Being concerned in Taiwan and the world to compose poetry, prose and novel with local and world views.
 - 3.3 Expressing a real life, resisting bullies, and the voice of oppressors, and the hard public.

3.4 Enhancing the quality of the Taigi literature and songs & poems.

3.5 Pursuing script standardization and literary language status for Taigi.

From the first and the second article above, we could see that the Hanchi Poetry Society pursued the status of literary language for Taiwan's native languages. *The Hanchi Poetry Publication* completed their claims and contained poetry, prose, novels and comments. It also published articles related to the language movement and the Taigi literature movement in the 1990s. In addition to sponsors, writers in the society included Siangyang, Hu Min-Siang, Chen Lei, Lin Chen-Mo, and A.D.Sakabulajo. Through the main thoughts of the Hanchi Poetry Society and its writers, we could observe how the Taigi literature camps, through the societies, pursued the status of literary language and high language status for Taigi.

B. The 'Taiwanese Writing Forum' in Los Angeles

Tai-Bun Thong-Sin (Taiwanese Correspondence) has been a monthly magazine that was published on July 1st 1991, by the Taiwanese Writing Forum located in Los Angeles, California until 2007. It was written with the Han-Roman mixed writing style. In order to encourage Taiwanese to speak and write Taiwanese, Cheng Liang-Guang, the general editor, made an inaugural statement in the debut issue as follows:

Language and script are social objects. Whether the Taigi movement's popularity and attempts at standardization succeed or not, Taigi will continue to be the common language, which depends on the people who identify and are concerned about Taiwan. When the fire of the match is extinguished, we believe that the candle will continue to be passed on.

After being published a second year in America, *Tai-Bun Thong-Sin* started being sold in Taiwan and they established local headquarters and agents to handle publication in Taiwan. The agency was 'Li Kang-Khiok Taigi Cultural & Educational Foundation' who agreed to publish the magazine and the agent was Tan Hong-Hui. From 1993 to 1994, different counties and cities held monthly reader communication meetings to encourage the "speaking and reading of Taigi". In addition, the Society also started Taigi reading and writing classes and went onto school campuses to assist the activities of the Taigi society. The contents of *Tai-Bun Thong-Sin* have focused on comments about language, culture and politics. *Tai-Bun Thong-Sin* was created by overseas Taiwanese and has contributed greatly to the development of Taigi literature. Obviously, the publication of *Tai-Bun Thong-Sin* was also seeking high language status for Taigi.

C. The Promotion Society of Taiwanese Literature

The Promotion Society of Taiwanese Literature was established on May 28th 1995 and they published *Gadang Taiwanese Monthly Journal*. It stopped publishing on April 1st 1999, with a total of 25 issues. The Promotion Society of Taiwanese Literature was the biggest organized movement in the history of the Taiwanese literature movement. It included Taigi writers, Taigi script researchers, Taigi movement advocators and the people who concerned about Taigi, both domestically and overseas. The poet Lin Yang-Min was the first chairman of this society and an extremely important person to the organization. The important members and writers of this society were Lin Yang-Min, Jhang Chun-Huang, Huang Yuan-Sing, Lin Ming-Nan, Lin Zong-Yuan, Huang Jing-Lian, Chen Jin-Sun, Jhuang Buo-Lin, Huang Jin-Tian, Chiang Yuang-Chin and I. The main purposes of this society are listed as

follows:

Article 2: The society is a cultural movement organization to promote Taiwanese language and literature, to build up Taiwanese identity, to recover local culture, and to develop a new culture for Taiwan as its main goals. It aims for the integration of the Taigi phonetic alphabet and to systemize and computerize the script in order to promote the convenient usage for general people and in order to achieve speaking Taiwanese orally and achieve the goal of writing with the hands.

Article 3: This society has the basic standpoints for the language and ethnic groups:

- 3.1 Taigi, Hakka, Mandarin and different kinds of indigenous language are the official languages of Taiwan.
- 3.2 Speaking Taigi and mother languages are the basic rights of Taiwanese.
- 3.3 Language and ethnic cultures are equal and we are against any oppression policy for languages and cultures.
- 3.4 Every Taiwanese should respect and identify the majority, and respect the minority.
- 3.5 Taiwan government has to educate native people to speak Taigi.
- 3.6 Abolishing the name, “national language”, and discrimination of the National Language Policy.

There were a total of seven chapters and twenty-three articles that set out the main thoughts of the Taigi Promotion Society, all written in Taigi, and the main thoughts reflected the main points of the society in the post war era. It insisted on a subjective language policy and reflected the action of language promotion. *Gadang Taiwanese Monthly Journal*, the society’s publication, promoted the creation of Taigi

literature and reported the Taigi literature movement developments and Taigi activity news as well. The first chairman of this society, the poet Lin Yang-Min, also edited a series called the *Taigi Literature Anthology*, a total of five volumes, including *Language Culture and Nation*, *The Conference Proceedings of Taigi Literature Movement*, *The Taigi Poetry for Sixty Years*, *The Taigi Prose A Century*, and *The Taigi Novels*. I observed that the Taigi Promotion Society expanded the works of Taigi literature, educated many young newly recruited writers, and expanded the Taigi literature movement. This society expressed Taigi ideas to ordinary people in order to pursue the goal of Taigi becoming a high language and script.

The above three Taigi societies influenced the expansion of Taigi literature in the period of the Taigi literature debates. After the Taigi literature debates, many societies and publications were established. These societies included the Taigi Literature Society, the Banana Flower Taigi Magazine Society, the Kuann-bang-hue Taigi Literature Society, the Hai-ang Taigi Literature Monthly Journal and Taiwanese Literature Battlefront publications, and so on. They are listed as following:

A. The Taigi Literature Society:

Sigiann Taiwanese Monthly Journal was published in November 1998 by the Taigi Literature Society, and stopped publishing in May 2004, with a total of 37 issues. The reasons for publishing the *Sigiann Taiwanese Monthly Journal* were to continue the publication of *Daiqi Segai (Taiwanese World)*. This was free feedback for supporters in order to promote the Taigi movement. The writers included the original Taigi writers of *Daiqi Segai* and encouraged many of the younger generation to write works of literature in Taigi. Chiang Yuang-Chin (Gang Ying-Zin) and Jhang Cun-Huang (Diunn Cun-Hong) were important persons involved in this publication.

The first editor, Shen Dong-Cing, in the first issue stated that the main purpose of this magazine was as follows:

1. Promoting a standardized script for Taiwanese, which can be localized, modernized, nationalized, and computerized in order to build up the normal status of Taigi in Taiwan society.
2. Using the spelling scheme of Tongyong Pinyin.
3. Offering a writing layout for the user of Taiwanese writing with English style.
4. Accumulating language data resources to supply academic researches.
5. Expanding the culture of mother tongue, creating the new features of Taiwan literature.

The purpose mentioned in this inaugural statement was Taigi script standardization, building up Taigi to normal status in Taiwanese society, by pursuing the status of literary language as a high language and script for Taigi. Although the *Sigiann Taiwanese Monthly Journal* stopped publication, the core members, Chiang Yuang-Chin and Jhang Cun-Huang still kept the Taigi literature movement going by translating and editing Taigi fairy tales to expand the view of native children literature, to connect localization and globalization, to enrich the teaching resources of the mother tongue, and to recover the mother tongue and vernacular education. (Jhang 2004)

B. Lian-chiau-hoe Tai-bun Chap-chi Agency

The Lian-chiau-hoe Tai-bun Chap-chi Agency published the *Lian-chiau-hoe Tai-bun Chap-chi magazine* in January 1999, and it was still being published in 2007. The members were a breakaway from the Society of Taiwan Language and Literature Research in Taijiong. Most of the literary works were written in the writing style of

Han characters or a mixture of Han and Roman. The members were Taigi writers or movement advocates, such as Chen Yen-Huei, Lai Miao-Hua, Yang Jhao-Yang, Li Sun-Liang, Zeng Dun-Siang, and Jhang Guang-Yu. This publication represented the Taigi movement in the Taichung area. Jhang Guang-Yu, one of the members, spent more than ten years editing the dictionary entitled *Loanwords in Taiwanese*, which covered 28,000 phrases and was published in October 2005.

C. Kuann-bang-hue Taigi Literature Society:

The Kuann-bang-hue Taigi Literature Society published *Kuann-bang-hue Poetry Anthology* in June 1997, and published a revolutionary fifth issue in 2006. It published four issues of *Kuann-bang-hue Taigi Literature* between 1999 and 2001. The presidents of the council included Huang Jing-Lian, Si Ping-Hua, Fang Yao-Cian, Jhou Ding-Bang, and so on, and the chief editor was Fang Yao-Cian. This society promoted not only Taigi literature but also mother tongue and language teaching. This publication represented the Taigi literature movement in the Tainan area.

D. Hai-ang Taigi Literature Monthly Journal

Khai-long Magazine Cooperation Limited published the *Hai-ang Taigi Literature Monthly Journal* from February 2001 until the present. In addition to Taigi literature creation, it also published children's literary creations for the purposes of vernacular teaching. The purposes of the publication are: (1) Through 'speaking the parents' language, and writing the Taiwanese script,' achieving the standardization and literary status for Taigi for the subjectivity of Taiwan literature. (2) Pursuing the fertilization of Taigi literature in order to build up a traditional base of Taigi literature. (3) Researching and expanding the creation of Taigi literature in order to root it deeply in Taiwan culture and communicate with the national community. (4) Making friends

with local people and people who are enthusiastic about Taigi language and literature in order to promote the Taiwanese Renaissance movement. (5) Developing Hai-ang, the spirit of the ocean, to promote vernacular education in order to promote the harmony of ethnic groups. Obviously their goal was to pursue the status of high language for Taigi.

E. Taiwanese Literature Battlefield

The Taiwanese Literature Battlefield was a society formed by a group of writers who insisted on the principle of Taigi literature. The society also published a magazine using the same name, which was first published in December 2004, with the ninth issue published in January 2008. The main members were Lin Yang-Min, Fang Yao-Cian, Chen Jin-Sun, Jhou Ding-Bang, Hu Chang-Song and so on. The purpose of the Taiwanese Literature Battlefield has been to root the Taigi consciousness and Taiwan ideology in Taiwan culture and combine traditional and modern spirits in order to develop and upgrade Taiwan native literature art, to advocate the nation literature thoughts, to promote the Taiwanese Renaissance movement, and to recover Taiwanese culture dignity and subjectivity. The Taiwanese Literature Battlefield kept struggling through the reunion of the new and old generations, which represented the symbol of the continuous spirit of the Taigi literature movement, in order to fully pursue the goal of attaining the status of high language and script for Taigi.

In addition, To-hiong Taigi Literature Works started publishing works in January 1998, and published *To-hiong Taigi Literature* in March the same year, totaling 31 issues. It stopped being publishing in 2004. Although the Taigi societies and publications like *Tai-Bun Thong-Sin* monthly magazine and *Taiwanese Literature Battlefield* still keep being published, it can't be denied that the amount of both Taigi

readers and Taigi writers grew very slowly and was limited. Currently the subscribers or those who receive free access to movement publications are still very low demand and commercial newspapers and magazines assign almost no space to Taigi literary creations. The implementation of vernacular education in elementary schools is only a window-dressing measure for the creation of diverse language and culture. It is not enough to only teach listening and speaking in a language for one hour a week, to say nothing of training in reading and writing. The Taiwan literature departments in colleges always focus on Mandarin literary works thus the space of Taigi literature is still limited to the corners of Taiwan society. The key points could be the lack of culture awakening movements for Taiwanese and the hegemony of the still-implemented National Language Policy.

5.2 Striving for high language: Language and culture awakening

movements and dilemma for indigenous people and Hakka ethnic groups

When the Holo ethnic groups started to cultivate and pursue literary status for Taigi literary language, the authority of Mandarin was challenged. The language and culture of each ethnic group was encouraged to strive for the position of high language. The wave of democratization of Taiwan in 1980s had aroused culture awakening movements for indigenous people and language movements of Hakka ethnic groups. Once-suppressed multi-languages and multi-cultures had the chance to be set free. Establishing a multi-language and multicultural society could be a reality in Taiwan soon. However, undeniably, this process will still be filled with difficulty. This paragraph will introduce the awakening of the culture of indigenous people and language movements of Hakka ethnic groups respectively, and explore the dilemmas they face.

5.2.1 Language and culture awakening movement and dilemma for indigenous people

Culture awakening movements of indigenous people have played a very important role in the process of striving for high language status. Articles written in indigenous language might be the last dilemma to be overcome. Culture awakening movements of indigenous groups originated from the identity crisis of the indigenous people. *Green High Mountain* magazine edited by Iban Nokan from the Atayal tribe in 1983 was the first publication that advocated the consciousness crisis of indigenous people. The opening issue of this magazine chiefly put forth two contentions. Firstly, Taiwanese indigenous people were facing the fateful crisis of genocide. Secondly, it advocated the creation of an awakening movement for Taiwanese aborigines. (Tsai 2007) At the end of the following year, 1984, the advocators Hu De-Fu, Tong Cun-Cing, Monaneng and so on, established the ‘Alliance of Taiwan Aborigines’ in Taipei. The main purposes of ATA were “According to the spirit of ethnic equality, we seek the solidarity and progress of Taiwanese aboriginal ethnics inside our group and protect the culture of Taiwanese clan culture of aboriginal ethnics and prolong our life by the way of service, script, speech, movement. For sure, we guarantee and promote Taiwanese as the right of aborigine ethnics”. The main purposes expressed indigenous strength. In 1987, ATA changed its name to “Association for the Rights Promotion of indigene Nation” to emphasize the independent rights of the ‘nation’ (Tsai 2007) In July 1985, the association established a monthly publication entitled *Shan Wai Shan*. It provided indigenous people with a way to speak out, and also offered indigenous writers a place to publish their works.

There were some other publications related to the culture awakening movement.

Aboriginal Post, the first indigenous newspaper, was established by Taibang Sasale etc in May 1989. The magazine titled *Hunter Culture* was established by Walis Nokan in August 1990. The *Mountain and Ocean Culture* journal was established by the Mountain and Ocean Culture Magazine Agency in 1993. (Tsai 2007) Among them, the issue of *Aboriginal Post* was published for the longest time and had the most special features. *Aboriginal Post* was a publication about the awakening movement of indigenous people. The publication agency had published twenty-seven issues by July 1995. The main purposes of the issue were 'Retrieving the original condition of Taiwan history, rebuilding the dignity of indigene ethnic, and founding a diversity of culture.' *Aboriginal Post* gave an effective self-examination and judgment on the contemporary social system and related phenomena. In addition to reporting related news, monographs, literature, and legends of indigenous people, it also had an indigene voiced national forum. In February 1994, the orientation of *Aboriginal Post* was moved back towards the tribe as the publisher hoped to focus on tribe doctrine. They wanted to refocus on tribe culture in order to pursue the hypostasis of the indigenous people. These issues of the publications not only had certain effects on disputing the exploitation and discrimination by Han people in politics, economy, and culture, but also encouraged indigenous writers to launch literary creations, which was a great help in chronicling and conserving traditional culture.

Sun Ta-chuan was gratified by the development of indigenous writers in 'resistance literature creation'. He thought that the indigenous writers had finally found a kind of written tool to disseminate their viewpoints and feelings. This could be seen as a movement of boycotting the ruling of mainstream culture. (Sun 2000) However, he neglected the effects of suppression that the indigenous languages suffered. Under the National Language Policy of implementing Mandarin as the

national language of Taiwan, indigenous languages and cultures are nearly exterminated due to assimilation. I think usage of Han writing in Taiwanese literature is a transitional strategy only. The most fundamental way should be rehabilitating indigenous language. Walis Noka, an indigenous writer, thought that literature written with the mother tongue of the ethnic groups has been a display of subjectivity. He said, "Indigenous literature is written by indigenous people using indigenous scripts. The works describe the indigenous people and the themes are related to the humanities and geography of the indigenous ethnic society." (Walis 2000:129)

Chen (2003) stated, in a society where Han people have been in the majority, the development of indigenous literature faced much pressure and challenges. In the early time of resistance to the Han, indigenous writers created literary works using Han characters to communicate with Han people. Afterward, they adopted a way of using both indigenous Roman scripts and Han characters or blending Roman script with Han characters. All of the following works were written using both mother tongue script and Han characters: Ruwalis (1990), Siaben (1992), Siaman (1992), Lin(1998), Yu and Oyang (2002).

The fact that indigenous language delimits indigenous literature is an ineluctable trend leading towards the reconstruction of the indigenous mother tongue and the development of indigenous literature. While the Indigenous language is striving for high language status, there are still many difficulties. Firstly, the problem of script standardization should be overcome because historically there was only a tradition of oral history. Secondly, it has been difficult to spread use of the mother tongue due to the decrease in numbers of the ethnic population.

Firstly, currently the indigenous script was still in the initial stages of development. Early church written systems have already started to be seen as valuable. The first indigenous textbook using the mother tongue was formally published in August 1991. After two years of data collection and research, the Promotion Committee of Mother Tongue of the Atayal branch of the Christianity Presbyterian Church reorganized a series of Atayal textbooks, compiled in the Roman script. Through the cooperation and coordination of the Bureau of Education of Hsinchu County, education of mother tongue was popularized in mountain region townships such as Wufong and Jianshih. (Huang 1995) Elementary schools started to implement local language teaching in 2001. The Ministry of Education and the Council of Indigenous Peoples entrusted the Center for Aboriginal Studies (ALCD) to carry out 'a three year program to compile a textbook for indigenous people' in 2002. (Lim 2005)

Secondly, as stated, due to the serious decrease of indigenous populations, the spread of mother tongues was difficult. The indigenous languages encountered the same situation as other native languages, were suppressed by the *National Language Policy*. The number of the younger generation using the mother tongue has been seriously decreased, thus it becomes much more difficult to create works of literature using indigenous language. There were only 460,000 indigenous people at present, which accounts for 1.89% of Taiwan's total population. (Pasuya 2005) They are divided into 13 ethnic groups and each ethnic group has its unique language. When they go out of the tribe, they have to face the dilemma of using a non-mother tongue. Traditionally, the tribe was the best cultural community for keeping the mother tongue in usage. However, due to the influence of the Mandarin-only policy, Mandarin has already entered indigenous society and even invaded the personal domain of the

family. Although local language teaching was implemented in 2000, only one hour of mother tongue teaching was allowed per week. Thus we can see that the Mandarin-only policy still casts a shadow on indigenous people in Taiwan. This kind of circumstance has already made the mother tongue drift towards extinction. It will be a great challenge for indigenous language to strive for the goal of high language and script status.

5.2.2 Language movements and dilemma for Hakka ethnic groups

Language movements of Hakka ethnic groups have played a very important role in the process of striving for high language status. The development of Hakka literature has been a dilemma that finally needed to be overcome. The main strength of Hakka ethnic groups language movements came from three organizations. They were *Hakka Headlines* magazine, Taiwan Hakka Association for Public Affairs and Formosa Hakka Radio Station. *Hakka Headlines* magazine was the first independently operated print media organization run by a Hakka ethnic group. In October 1987, the opening issue of this magazine put forth the following aphorism, “Recently, we were deeply alerted that the Hakka language which everyone speaks since childhood is already gradually vanishing. After several years, the language will be eliminated, the Hakkas culture will vanish along with it, and the Hakka ethnic groups will disintegrate gradually. If we do not awaken, consolidate, and struggle diligently right now, we will be ashamed to face our Hakka ancestors and will be unable to have an explanation for posterity.” (Huang 1995) The movement of ‘Return Hakkinese to Me’ was launched immediately the following year by this magazine.

On December 28, 1988, the Association for Hakka Ethnic Rights, which was composed members of the *Hakka Headlines* magazine agency, Hakka associations

and movement advocates for workers and peasants, launched the 'Return Hakkanese to Me' movement and held large-scale demonstrations. This movement had three aims: Firstly, to open up Hakka broadcasts and TV programs; secondly, to implement bilingual education, and build up a policy of equal language; thirdly, to revise the limited provision for dialects in the 'Law of Broadcast and TV' to become a protective provision. (Yang 1991) This act not only caused Hakkanese language movements to reach a climax but also led to an increase in other 'Return Mother Tongue to Me' movements by other local ethnic groups. The 'Return Hakkanese to Me' movement strove for more speaking of Hakkanese in electronic media, vernacular education, and for equality of language. These were all the way to pursue language status for Hakkanese language, and enabled it to become a formal high language and script.

In 1990, *Hakka Headlines* magazine changed its name to *Hakka Magazine*. The main purposes of the magazine were "Cherish Hakkanese, identify the natives and survey the world". It is the longest running specialized magazine, dedicating to Hakkanese culture having and 205 issues published until July 2007. The main content of this magazine was focused on introducing the Hakkanese people through such pieces as commentaries of current events, reports of activities, character interviews, introductions to allusive characters in Hakka history and so on. In addition to this monthly magazine, they held many Hakka cultural activities to foster the talents of Hakkanese people, such as Hakka cultural summer camps, training classes of Hakka broadcasts for talented people, Hakka academic seminars, symposiums, travels in Hakka culture and so on. The appearance of *Hakka magazine* was the first step for Hakka language to strive for the goal of high language status.

The 'Taiwan Hakka Association for Public Affairs' (HAPA) was established in December 1990. This was an association with a strong mission and native consciousness. It gathered writers, lawyers, scholars, doctors and ministers etc. into an integral whole. The first elected association president, Jhong Jhao-Jheng, actively carried out activities related to the reformation of society and the democracy movement. He also made every effort to rescue the language and culture of Hakka ethnic groups. The association referred to this idea in 'New Hakkanese' that "We would like to work hard for recovering our dignity and achieving our glory again. Moreover, we would like to have a rosy future with every ethnic group being hand in hand no matter if they are Holo ethnic groups or different provincial and indigenous ethnic groups." The appearance of HAPA certainly had a sizable contribution to the Hakkanese language movement.

Due to the influence of HAPA, Hakka languages had a significant breakthrough in the media. Formosa Hakka Radio Station was established in September of 1994. The main ideas of the station were promoting the consciousness of the Hakka community, caring for every stratum and ethnic group of society, and implementing public service services. On July 1, 2003, Hakka TV stations started broadcasting formally. The appearance of Hakka TV stations broke the exclusive domination of Mandarin and Holo language media and made Taiwan take a big step in striving for a multicultural society. It not only offered a platform for Hakka ethnic groups, but also began to present the views of Hakka ethnic groups. Because of the efforts of organizations such as *Hakka Magazine*, HAPA, Formosa Hakka Radio Station, and Hakka TV stations, Hakka movements not only revitalized the Hakka language and culture, but also offered the opportunity for Taiwanese society to study and understand Hakka language and culture. Furthermore, the movement facilitated a

harmonious space for creation of a multi-ethnic and multi-language society.

Media breakthroughs improved the momentum of Hakka language; however, the creation of a Hakka literary language might still face difficulties in attaining high language and script status. Luo Zhao-Jin thought, “Hakka literature is works that think with Hakka language, and write about life in Hakka society. There is no absolute relation to whether the author is a Hakka ethnic or not, what province and county his family is registered in, and which kind of language he uses.” (Luo 2001: 6) He defined Hakka literary language as ‘thinking with Hakka language’ but not limited to writing with the Hakka language. Most current Hakka literature belongs to this group that he described. This literature had the special feature of Hakka consciousness, but it didn’t belong to the Hakkanese literature with agreement of the spoken language and written language, for instance Wu (1995), Li (1991; 1995), Jhong (1993) and so on. I think it cannot be denied that these literary works have made a contribution to revitalizing Hakka culture as well as enriching Mandarin literature. However it is hard to strengthen Hakka language and culture properly unless a Hakkanese literature can be developed. This has been the dilemma, which needed to be overcome in Hakkanese literature. If the goal of Hakka language movements is to save the Hakka languages, creation and promotion of Hakkanese literature should be the highest goal of the movements. Although Huang Heng-Ciu defined Hakka literature with broad explanation, he still seemed to pursue the goal of agreement of spoken language and written language for Hakkanese literature.

Huang (2001) defined Hakka literature with two factors. The first one is literature, such as poems, novels, prose, drama and so on. The other is the Hakkanese creation, including Hakka consciousness and the writing with Hakkanese. Most

literary works written in Hakkanese were modern poems, lyrics, and short compositions. The writers who were involved in these works were Du Pan Fang-Ge, Fan Wun-Fang, Huang Heng-Ciu, Tu Min-Heng, and Yie Rih-Song amongst others. (Huang 2001) Those who had personal anthologies are as follows: Huang (1990), Huang (1993), Long & Huang (1995), Ciu (2004) and so on. Although publications of personal anthologies began to be published in Hakka literary language, it's a pity that no pure Hakkanese publications were published. Most literary creations written in Hakkanese were published in several parts in articles of community publications in Hakka villages, such as *Liudui Magazine*, *Liudui Headlines Magazine*, and the *Culture Journal of Taipei City Hakka Committee*. Otherwise, they were published in local Mandarin publications, such as *Li* poetry publication. Even professional Hakka culture magazines such as *Hakka Magazine*, published few literary creations in Hakkanese.

Actually, this situation, where there was a lack of pure Hakkanese magazines being published, reflected the dilemma of Hakkanese literature development. This was a crisis of Hakkanese language and culture development exacerbated by the lack of those able to read and write in Hakkanese. According to the observations of Luo Zhao-Jin about the mother tongue ability of Hakka ethnic groups, “The people under the age of 20 have nearly forgotten their mother tongue, the people who are on the right side of 30 are unable to speak the mother tongue correctly, and the people who are on the right side of 40 are already unable to make a speech with the mother tongue.” (Luo 1990: 26) Obviously, it is clear that Hakkanese is facing a serious decline. Without language, we may say that there is no literature. The Hakka language has already achieved prominence in the public field of media and is in the process of striving from low language to high language status, however, the Hakka language still

needs to be further cultivated. This is the dilemma of Hakka literary language that needed to be overcome in striving for high language status.

5.3 Promoting equilibrium development between localization and globalization

5.3.1 Returning to the identification of native language and local culture

What is localization? This study mainly refers to localization as an identifying action of native language and local culture. Yeh (2001) suggested that localization, due to the great impact of outside cultures, was the practiced action of specific conscious orientations. Moreover, this impact was big enough to make an apparent threat to both the emotional emergence existing within a society and cognitive thinking patterns. It even provoked crisis awareness about culture. (Yeh 2001) This definition offers this study an excellent definition of localization. The KMT government built and constructed a monopoly of Mandarin language in Taiwan in the post-war era, and suppressed native languages through education, media-propaganda and decree-making etc. By implementing the 'National Language Policy' and maintaining language domination through political means, Mandarin became the formal high language of the public field. At the same time, Taiwanese became a non-formal low language due to suppression and prohibition. Consequently, native languages face a survival crisis, and as a result, many Holo ethnic groups launched the Taigi literature movement to construct identification about native language and local culture. (See also ch2&3) In addition, indigenous people and Hakka ethnic groups also launched language-awareness and culture-awareness movements in order to ruminate on local identification in native language and local culture.

Compared to other ethnic groups in Taiwan, indigenous people suffered more regarding local identifying issues. This was because firstly indigenous people faced a survival crisis and also due to language-cultural awareness. In the era of Taiwan social movements and democratization, indigenous people were mobilized in support of a series of significant survival issues, such as land return, name rectification and aboriginal autonomy. Indigenous people resisted the domination of Mandarin and strived for the awarding of minimum rights normally enjoyed by the Han. (Sun 2000) In addition, they pushed indigenous language and culture into the public arena, even mounting the political platforms of Taiwan. They renamed the 'Council of Aboriginal Affairs, Executive Yuan' established in December 1996, the 'Council of Indigenous Peoples, Executive Yuan', established in March 2002. They also started broadcasting aboriginal TV stations formally in July 2005. Through the operation of central organizations and specialization in electronic media, the aims of aboriginal localization became more powerful.

Though the identification issue of Hakka people did not face a survival crisis like the aborigines, the situation for Hakka people was actually very awkward and ambiguous in Taiwan society. Because of historical factors, Hakka ethnic groups were regarded as Han people by the Indigenous peoples. However when compared to Holo people, the historical records of Hakka ethnic groups were ignored. (Chen 1993), Hakka ethnic groups were always considered to be an invisible ethnic group. But with the 'Return Hakkanese to me' movement launched by *Hakka Brilliancy Magazine* and some civil associations in December 1988, Hakka ethnic groups were no longer invisible. They demanded open broadcasting and TV media, and equal language policies. Subsequently, the Hakkanese language and cultural awakening movements were eagerly established. In addition, the Taiwan Hakka Public Affairs Association

was established and the establishment of the Formosa Hakka Broadcasting Station reinforced the self-identification of Hakka ethnic groups. The government set up the Council for Hakka Affairs, Executive Yuan on June 14, 2001, to deal with Hakkinese issues and the establishment of a TV station in July 2003, which enabled Hakkinese language to appear in the public field. This not only fostered the identification of Hakkinese language and culture but also impelled Han culture in Taiwan to recognize the creation of a diversified society.

Because of the appeal of localization, Taiwan has begun to be a diversified society. However, native languages have still not been paid much attention. After the rise of Taiwanese nationalism in 1980s, every ethnic group rediscovered their own cultures and language thus the value of local Taiwanese culture was once again appreciated. Democratization in Taiwanese society not only broke down the dominant Mandarin culture shaped by the 'National Language Policy', but also facilitated the cultural movements based on ethnicities rather than mainstream perspectives. Native languages are no longer regarded as low language, and Taiwan is marching toward becoming a multi-language and multicultural society. All these trends are still exterior phenomena, however, because of the continued existence of the 'National Language Policy'. Mandarin still exclusively dominates many areas of life, especially education. Moreover, English is considered to be the language of globalization and preferred to native languages due to the attraction of exotic things.

5.3.2 The impact of English in globalization

David Crystal stated in *English as a Global Language*, that English has become a new global language due to the superpower status of the West in military, politics, knowledge, media and the economy. (Hung 2001) Up till now, approximately

one-fourth of the world's population speaks English. The number of English speakers has already exceeded the number of Han speakers. There are more than seventy countries that have English as an official language. There are more than one hundred countries that classify English as their second foreign language. (Hung 2001) In the 19th century, the British Empire ruled over many colonies and influenced international trade. In addition, in the post war era, America achieved military, economic, scientific and technological dominance. We can see that the impact of English due to globalization will be long lasting. And certainly Taiwan has been influenced by the globalization power of English.

Taiwan lies in the southwest corner of the Pacific Ocean, in a place that has seen conflict between East and West. Since it was discovered by Portugal, Taiwan has been influenced by exotic cultures. Europe occupied Taiwan first, and this was followed by colonial rule by China and Japan. After WWII, America became involved in Taiwan and when the Korean War broke out in 1950s, America adopted the Containment Policy towards China, and sent the seventh fleet to help defend the Taiwan Straits. America also offered economic aid to Taiwan. The total amount of aid reached nearly 1,500 million US dollars during the 15 years from 1951 to June 1965. This aid had a significant impact on Taiwan in many areas like stabilizing the price of living, and aiding economic development and science and technology. (Li & Lin 2003b) In this way, Taiwan experienced an economic miracle, which resulted in international trade prosperity. Huge American economic aid drove the economic prosperity of Taiwan and this naturally stimulated English learning among Taiwanese.

I believe that the trend of English study caused the disappearing of the mother tongue. In 1980s, the democratization movement of Taiwan grew vigorously, and

localization began to have an impact. During the Taigi literature debates, the issue of native language usage resulted in a large number of discussions, which were the first meetings between English and Taiwanese. However, the development of native language and local culture, in the early period, couldn't compete with the power of English, which has been dominant for hundreds of years. Most of the advocators of the movement, who were also engaged in the democratization movement were greatly concerned about political reformation, but didn't think about localization, just like people who grew up under the KMT regime. As soon as they were entitled to make political decisions, they were incapable of having localization thoughts. The loss of the mother tongue was due to the wrong language policy. While the Lee Teng-hui KMT era, the introduced one hour a week 'Local Language Teaching' for the education of primary students, however, the time was too little. It was a pity that there were no increase in hours by the DPP government, but English teaching hours during the same time have increased. This will undoubtedly be detrimental to vernacular education. (Babu 2007)

Since 2001, the DPP government has implemented English education in elementary schools, as well as vernacular education. The outcome of multi-language implementation has been to lay particular stress on English but to ignore vernacular education. Why does so-called bilingual education refer to Chinese and English only and not to the mother tongue? Vernacular education corresponds to the appeal of localization, while English education corresponds to the trend of globalization. Taiwanese society is deeply influenced by American culture, and most people treat English education with a worshipping attitude. In this way, the position of English has become higher than any other language in Taiwan. This is demonstrated by the language level graph shown in Chapter one. (See also ch1.4) The Ministry of

Education allows at least one hour every week of mother tongue teaching, but most of the cities or counties ignore this, whereas English teaching is provided for two hours every week for 5th and the 6th grade students in elementary schools, with other grades receiving at least one hour. As a result, can we say that English education extended down to elementary school level has led to the promotion of general English competence by Taiwan students?

The facts are not so optimistic. Based on my experience as a teacher at elementary school, half of the students attend English cram schools after school, with the other half only learning English in school. The amount of time learning English makes an apparent difference, especially in junior high, where the distinction among them becomes even more apparent. Is English taught in elementary school to improve the students' knowledge or just to follow a fashion? According to a report by Jiang (2005) indicated that starting to learn English in elementary school didn't have many benefits. Conversely it was more beneficial for students to learn English in junior high school and this would have a better impact on their English performance in college. If students weren't able to perform well in junior high, their English performance in the future would fall behind. Chen (2004) pointed out that the Ministry of Education's distribution of English teaching resources was distorted with most going to elementary schools and less going to junior high schools. Apparently, this policy needed improving. Not until junior high school English education was reinforced would the outcome of English education be improved.

5.3.3 How to achieve the equilibrium development between localization and globalization

In my opinion, English plays a very important role in the process of globalization, but the importance of identifying native languages and cultures can't be ignored either. However, how to balance the development between the two? I think that following the logical stages of learning a 'foreign language after the mother tongue' as suggested by Lee (2003), could be worthy of consideration. Ang (2002) thought that the critical period for language learning was between ages one to seven for preschool kids, and then the mother tongue should be used to mediate between the first and second languages. In this way, native languages and cultures would definitely be passed down. A lot of parents urged their kids to start English learning in elementary school, and even in kindergarten for fear that their kids would fail on the starting line. However, this not only couldn't guarantee the continuity of native language and culture, but probably would hurt children's character development. Wu (2002) thought that English learning at a much earlier stage would result in too much pressure on children, and even caused a tense relationship between parents and kids when parents tried to help their kids review English, as well as generating ego problems or cultural awareness problems. Syu (2005) stated that kids couldn't communicate fluently due to their poor ability of expression in English or because of teasing by their peers, which was not good for their social development. Children with weak English competence might have bad character development and poor self-image because of their frustration about language learning.

However the issue of when children should begin to learn English learning is still disputed. There has been much discussion about the issues raised in 'The relevant key aspects of foreign language learning' in other research papers, such as those by scholars such as Lenneberg, (1967); Penfield & Roberts, (1959); Scovel, (1988);

Seliger, (1978). These scholars all agreed that the earlier a foreign language learned, the better would be the result. On the other hand, scholars such as Ekstrand, (1979); Kinsbourne, (1981); Snow, Hoefnagel-Hohle, (1977, 1978) and Walsh & Diller, (1981) disagreed with this assertion. They thought that there were no relevant key expectations for foreign language learning. Starting to learn a second language at a certain age had no definite results. (Cited from Wu & Chang 2002)

Chang (2001) listed four reasons of debate in support of early learning of foreign languages: (1) The Foreign language learning teaches relevant key expectations. (2) Speech acquisition is better, (3) Interference of the affection factor is less. (4) The culture acceptance is high. There were five disagreed reasons of debate of the fact that kids could not learn foreign language too early: (1) The Foreign language learning has no relevant key expectations. (2) Speech acquisition has nothing to do with age. (3) Foreign language learning interferes with kids learning their mother tongue. (4) Their learning results are not good. (5) Foreign language learning cuts into the time spent on the core curriculum of preschool education. (Cited from Huang 2007) The disagreed reason (3) in Chang's (2001) research stated that in a non-bilingual environment, teaching a child a foreign language too early would hinder mother tongue acquisition, I think if the mother tongue is neglected in favor of Mandarin, then this will hurt the native language more seriously. The disagreed reason (4) in Chang's (2001) research stated that learning had to be done under meaningful conditions and then the result would be good. After all there was no bilingual learning environment in Taiwan. Lin (2005) thought that Taiwan has been unlike many European nations where the people all have had the natural environment background of various languages. Taiwan has also been unlike Singapore and Hong Kong, which were once colonies of an English-speaking nation where English was

spoken widely and there was an English media. In contrast, English was basically a foreign language in Taiwan.

Therefore teaching of children still has to return to the level of mother tongue education. Wu and Chang (2002) thought that the ability of reading and writing of the mother tongue could not only help kids learn foreign languages more efficiently but also could protect the kid's mother tongue ability. The development of the kid's mother tongue reading and writing ability was far more important than foreign language learning. From the above research, it is thus clear what the learning priority should be between mother tongue and foreign language learning. Lee (2003) claimed that the logical stages of language learning should be 'foreign language after the mother tongue'. He had unique insight into the learning sequences of children's mother tongue and foreign language learning. He emphasized building up the learning foundation of mother tongue first during the younger years was the best way to proceed. He said that much research also supported the building up of a person's language learning and increasing their mother tongue ability first could enable them to more effectively absorb and connect to other languages and knowledge. If not, then the ability of the mother tongue would be out of tune and they would lack confidence and had an unstable personality throughout their whole life. The author agrees with Lee's viewpoint; mother tongue education can foster a person's identification with native languages and culture, and thus fill them with confidence in the outside world.

Obviously, if equilibrium between localization and globalization can be realized, localized identification should be first taken into consideration, namely the identification of native languages and cultures. And localization should face the problem of common languages. The Ministry of Education declared the ' Preschool

Children English Education Policy ' in October 2004. One of three points offered was that the language learning order should be mother tongue first, then Mandarin, and then English. The main plan of the Ministry of Education was to cultivate children's competence in both mother tongue and Mandarin at the preschool stage or 1st and 2nd grade of elementary school. After this foundation of local language was built up, the foreign language could then follow (Huang 2007). Babu (2007) stated the same opinion, too. Without elevating the language level of the mother tongue and realizing mother tongue education, the mother tongue and culture of every ethnic group couldn't be maintained and developed. Under this circumstance, the implementation of official languages in secondary school and higher stage schools could facilitate the coexistence and co-honor of every ethnic group, which would make Taiwan a true democratized country with a multi-language and multicultural society. (Ang 2002)

Brief summary

After the Taigi literature debates, more and more persons were involved in Taiwanese literature tasks. The Taigi literature movement kept prosperously developing, which also fostered the performance of Taigi literature energy within Taiwanese society. However, even with the continued existence of Taiwanese associations and journals, like *Tai-Bun Thong-Sin* and *Taiwanese Battlefield*, the amount of the population who is literate in Taigi, undeniably, is still limited. Thus the living space of Taigi literature is still limited. Apart from the lack of cultural awakening movements, the greatest obstacle is the continued implementation of the 'National Language Policy' specializing in Mandarin.

As Holo people began to pursue literary language status for Taigi, the authority of Mandarin was challenged and simultaneously every ethnic group has been

encouraged to make their own efforts for the status of high language. As a result, the original shape of native languages and cultures is visible. However, the dilemma still exists undeniably. Even with special organizations and broadcasting stations, there are still some difficulties to overcome.

As native language rises and English soon follows, how can the two be balanced? Following the logical stages of “First with mother tongue, then the common language, and lastly foreign language” seems to be practical. We can develop language education based on this procedure by making the preschool years from years one to seven for the critical period of mother tongue learning, and keeping using the mother tongue as a medium in elementary school. Only in this way can localization and globalization be balanced in the development of language learning.

Endnotes:

- ¹ There are two societies and their publications still existed as of 2007. One is *Tai-Bun Thong-Sin* established by ‘Taiwanese Writing Forum’ in Los Angeles in July 1991. The other is ‘Taiwanese Writing Post’ by Taiwanese Writing Society in Taipei, Taiwan in October 1996.